

# High Street Heritage Action Zone (HSHAZ) Evaluation

Case Study Appendix: Swaffham




Historic England

# HSHAZ Evaluation

Case Study Appendix: Swaffham

January 2025

Reviewed and approved by:	
Signature:	_____
Name:	<u>Graham Russell</u>
Job Title:	<u>Chief Executive</u>
Date:	<u>January 2025</u>

## Purpose of the case study

**This case study is not an evaluation of the Swaffham HSHAZ scheme. The purpose of the case studies as a whole is to provide insights to inform the overall HSHAZ programme evaluation.**

This case study appendix reviews the outputs achieved through the HSHAZ scheme against its stated targets and assesses likely value for money using government compliant methodologies. The review is based on:

- the monitoring data collected by project teams within submitted scheme plans;
- a facilitated discussion with the local project team and HSHAZ Project Officers using an agreed consultation guide to review successes, challenges and lessons learned;
- a site visit; and
- the expression of interest submission.

# 1 Strategic context

## 1.1 Context and need for investment

The Swaffham HSHAZ scheme was allocated £380,000 funding from Historic England for the capital strand and £50,000 funding from Historic England for the cultural strand. The capital strand was expected to generate £90,000 match funding from Breckland Council and £110,000 match-funding from other sources. The cultural strand was expected to generate £90,000 match funding from other sources<sup>1</sup>.

Swaffham is a small market town located within the Breckland district in Norfolk. The HSHAZ is in the marketplace at the heart of Swaffham town centre. The market town legacy dates to the Roman era with well-preserved architecture showcased by the 34 listed buildings in the town. The Buttercross serves as a reminder of Swaffham's long history as a centre for both trade and commerce.

High streets across the UK face similar challenges. Competition from online shopping and retail parks, rising vacancy rates, and the negative consequences of deprivation—such as homelessness and crime—are widely recognised as contributing factors to the difficulties experienced by high street communities and businesses. These macro trends are complemented by local trends. At the outset of the HSHAZ, it was identified that Swaffham had an uninviting pedestrian experience. However, more positively, it was recognised that recent partnership working in Swaffham could continue to enact positive change and there was a desire from community and business groups for investment to support greater recognition of Swaffham's commercial and tourism offer<sup>2</sup>.

## 1.2 HSHAZ scheme objectives

The Swaffham HSHAZ was seen as an essential starting point for discussions around wider partnership funding. A key objective of the scheme was to regenerate and restore its historic buildings to further reveal the town's heritage, whilst enhancing the attractiveness of the town's streetscape. The cultural programme in Swaffham aimed to enhance the understanding of the town's heritage through involving the local community within the development of the events. The programme looked to ensure a shared learning of the history of Swaffham.

Although not included within the HSHAZ, a longer-term focus was also placed on the pedestrianisation of the town centre which has previously been described as 'car dominated' with the traffic detracting from the heritage surrounding the marketplace. Pedestrianisation of the town centre is also detailed as a priority of several planning and policy documents.

<sup>1</sup> These allocations are from the first available scheme plans (Y1Q4 for the capital strand and Y3Q4 for the cultural strand)

<sup>2</sup> Swaffham HSHAZ Expression of Interest 2019

## 1.3 Strategic alignment

Table 1-1: Swaffham HSHAZ – Alignment with strategic priorities		
Policy/Strategy	Objective/Description	Alignment
Swaffham Neighbourhood Plan 2016-2036 Swaffham Town Council	<p>The Swaffham Neighbourhood Plan is a community led document commissioned by the Town Council to guide the future development of the area. Relevant objectives include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Provide high quality and well-designed development and public space that complements the distinctive character and heritage of Swaffham</li> <li>• Improve traffic flow within and around Swaffham</li> <li>• Ensure safe walking and cycling within the Swaffham town and area.</li> <li>• Encourage and support new and existing businesses to generate employment opportunities</li> <li>• Develop an economically viable and attractive town centre</li> <li>• Provide inclusive opportunities for cultural, leisure, community, sport and other social activities for all ages</li> </ul>	The delivery of the HSHAZ programme in Swaffham directly contributes to the objectives set out in the Swaffham Neighbourhood Plan. Improvement to the high street and investment in shop frontages supports the broader town objectives and facilitates sustainable economic and social development.
Breckland District Council Breckland's Corporate Plan 2024-2028	<p>The Breckland Corporate Plan sets out a vision for the district with priorities grouped across three themes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Inspiring Communities</li> <li>• Thriving Places</li> <li>• Working Smarter 2035</li> </ul> <p>Provide exceptional services in a flexible way to meet individuals needs and ensure services are accessible to all. Continue to innovatively use resources and ensure the best mix of service delivery models to deliver value for all.</p>	The thriving places priority detailed in the Breckland Corporate Plan is strategically aligned with the HSHAZ programme.
Breckland District Council Future Breckland: Thriving People and Places	<p>Future Breckland is a project to revitalise five market towns and to equip them for the future. Short term suggestions in Swaffham include installation of public art, trialling partial pedestrianisation schemes, improved signage and maps, tree planting and installing electric vehicle charging points. Longer term initiatives include pedestrianisation, reinvigorating the marketplace, creating a new leisure centre and culture and arts hub.</p>	The activities proposed by Future Breckland for Swaffham are directly aligned with the Swaffham HSHAZ. The Future Breckland plan details HSHAZ as a complimentary programme of activity to achieve the plan's short- and long-term goals.
Complementary funding	<p><u>National Lottery Heritage Fund</u></p> <p>Over the years, Swaffham has received various grants from the National Lottery Heritage Fund with a focus on the Marketplace itself. This includes:</p> <p>Swaffham Market 800: Exploring eight centuries of Market heritage, awarded £36,500 in 2015.</p> <p>Swaffham: Within Living Memory, awarded £50,000 in 2010 to the Swaffham Museum focusing on preserving and sharing oral histories from local residents, capturing the town's cultural memories and experiences.</p> <p>Swaffham – A Historic Market Town, grants between £10,000 and £250,000 in 2024 (<i>this funding is a follow on from works initialised by the HSHAZ</i>)</p>	The HSHAZ is well positioned to continue these heritage activities.

## 1.4 Activities

### 1.4.1 Capital strand

The main works of the capital strand focussed on public realm and restoring three priority building fronts. The list of projects is presented below:

- **Project 1 Project Officer Costs.**
- **Project 2 Conservation Area Appraisal** – including tendering for and adopting of the conservation area appraisal with public consultation and approval.
- **Project 3 Public Realm Masterplan** – preparation of the masterplan in line with Breckland Council ongoing and future funding programmes. A landscape architect employed to improve the appearance and usability of Swaffham centre.
- **Project 4 Preliminary Works and Architect Fees.**
- **Project 5 Conserving the Buildings and Restoring Shopfronts** – capital works to repair and conserve the buildings, restoring shopfronts at three priority buildings with associated engagement events and amended list entries throughout the town.
- **Project 6 Purchase Costs for Public Realm** – purchase costs for public realm works including bus shelters, bollards, cycle stands and wayfinding including installation.

The forecasted expenditure of the capital strand over the four-year programme is set out below. As previously mentioned, as the HSHAZ scheme attracted further match-funding, the total cost of the HSHAZ scheme increased to match these ambitions. Analysis on the cost outlay against outputs is presented in Section 3.

Table 1-2: Capital Strand Forecast Expenditure					
	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	2023/24	Total
Historic England grant	£0	£125,500	£158,500	£96,000	<b>£380,000</b>
Local authority funding	£0	£7,750	£70,249	£7,750	<b>£85,749</b>
Other matched funding	£0	£0	£53,250	£58,250	<b>£111,500</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>£0</b>	<b>£133,250</b>	<b>£281,999</b>	<b>£162,000</b>	<b>£577,249</b>

*Note: Forecast expenditure is from the Y1Q4 scheme plan, which is the first record of the forecasted costs. The evaluation of the scheme would be enhanced by accurate forecasts from the start of the programme.*

### 1.4.2 Cultural strand

The cultural strand was delivered by the Swaffham Cultural Consortium, placing focus on the Market Place with the aim of telling stories in an entertaining and informative manner. Annual themes such as ‘Carter 2022’ and ‘Under the Eye of the Buttercross’ engaged the local community in the cultural activities including:

- **Project 1 Community Mosaic** – workshops led by a mosaic artist to create an art installation contributed to be the community and installed within the HSHAZ s a permanent memorial piece containing a time capsule.

- **Project 2 Archaeological Excavation** – community excavation on Campingland led by a volunteer professional archaeologist.
- **Project 3 Drama** – a collaborative and interactive project between primary and high schools with regards to Howard Carter’s discover of Tutankhamun. (Project abandoned due to post pandemic restrictions and time constraints).
- **Project 4 Family Fun Day** – funfair in the high street with the Heritage Museum open at no charge to visitors. (Project abandoned due to the death of Queen Elizabeth, funds already spent reallocated to project 14).
- **Project 5 Other Activities.**
- **Project 6 New Activities not in Original Bid** – including the Swaffham Arts Concert, attendance at The Royal Norfolk Shoe and a local coffee morning.
- **Project 7 Administration** – administration such as equipment, advertising, health and safety, volunteer expenses etc. Payment for an events lead and a promotions lead.
- **Project 8 Coronation Challenge** – cream tea challenge in attempt to beat the world coinciding with Volunteer Day at the Coronation.
- **Project 9 Mapping Marketplace** – website providing information on each of the listed buildings in Swaffham high street.
- **Project 10 Food Event, Artisan Fair.**
- **Project 11 Horkey** – recreation of the Harvest Horkey, Thanksgiving service and Swaffham in Need food collection. Event profits to be donated to local school breakfast clubs.
- **Project 12 Working With Schools.**
- **Project 13 Organisation Days.**
- **Project 14 Closing Event** – Swaffham Heritage Week with an overview of delivery and celebration events delivered by the cultural strand.
- **Project 15 Legacy** – e.g. mosaic pyramid maintenance and mapping marketplace annual subscription/updates.

There was no forecast expenditure for the cultural strand from the early stages of the programme, prior to actual delivery. The first scheme plan made available was in the last quarter of 2022/23. This forecast expenditure is presented in the below table.

Table 1-3: Cultural Strand Forecast Expenditure					
	2020/21	2021/22	2022/23	2023/24	Total
Historic England grant	£2,000	£13,543	£34,907	£0	<b>£50,450</b>
Local authority funding	£0	£0	£0	£0	<b>£0</b>
Other matched funding	£0	£4,000	£5,000	£0	<b>£9,000</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>£2,000</b>	<b>£17,543</b>	<b>£39,907</b>	<b>£0</b>	<b>£59,450</b>

*Note: Forecast expenditure is from the Y3Q4 scheme plan, which is the first record of the forecasted costs. The evaluation of the scheme would be enhanced by accurate forecasts from the start of the programme.*



## 2 Project delivery and management

The HSHAZ was delivered by Breckland Council, utilising its project management and governance processes alongside the requirements from Historic England. The project manager from Breckland Council was previously the Swaffham project officer.

The Historic England team supporting the delivery of Swaffham HSHAZ included a project officer, a project lead and a senior responsible officer.

The cultural strand was focused on the Market Place and delivered by the Swaffham Cultural Consortium (led by the Swaffham Museum). The cultural strand engaged a wide set of stakeholders from the community and from local businesses.



## 3 Project progress

### 3.1 Overview

This section assesses the Swaffham HSHAZ against its stated costs, outputs, and objectives.

As set out in Section 1, the earliest capital scheme plan was in Y1Q4, although target outputs were only stated in Y2Q2. The earliest cultural scheme plan was in Y3Q4. The target costs and outputs have changed over time due to change requests. The final scheme plans typically suggest that the programme is delivered exactly on budget for every project with the exact level of outputs delivered.

To allow a comparison against the envisaged targets at the start of the HSHAZ programme, our assessment focusses on the delivered outputs and outturn costs against the targets from the earliest available information. Therefore, the original expenditure target figures for capital strand are from Y1Q4, the original output target figures are from Y2Q2, and all target figures for the cultural strand are from Y3Q4.

### 3.2 Capital strand

The Swaffham HSHAZ Capital Strand invested £879,000, a significant increase from the forecast of £577,000. This was because of an increase in funding from the Breckland Council which was greater than forecast in three of the four years of the programme. Other matched funding also increased from the forecast figure in the final year of the programme.

Table 3-1: Swaffham HSHAZ Capital Strand – annual spend performance					
	20/21	21/22	22/23	23/24	Total
<b>Forecast expenditure</b>					
Historic England grant	£0	£125,500	£158,500	£96,000	<b>£380,000</b>
Local authority funding	£0	£7,750	£70,249	£7,750	<b>£85,749</b>
Other matched funding	£0	£0	£53,250	£58,250	<b>£111,500</b>
<b>Total forecasted spend</b>	<b>£0</b>	<b>£133,250</b>	<b>£281,999</b>	<b>£162,000</b>	<b>£577,249</b>
<b>Outturn expenditure</b>					
Historic England grant	£0	£140,155	£138,941	£96,000	<b>£375,096</b>
Local authority funding	£10,288	£58,404	£54,780	£203,158	<b>£326,630</b>
Other matched funding	£0	£0	£2,668	£174,878	<b>£177,546</b>
<b>Outturn expenditure</b>	<b>£10,288</b>	<b>£198,559</b>	<b>£196,389</b>	<b>£474,036</b>	<b>£879,272</b>

In regard to Historic England funding, the overall programme spend was largely in line with the original forecast. Therefore, most projects came within, or under, the forecast budget including project officer costs, a conservation area appraisal, the public realm masterplan and the shopfront restoration scheme. The purchase costs for public realm improvements were slightly more expensive than expected which was covered by a reallocation of costs from the conserving buildings and restoring shopfronts project.

Table 3-2: Swaffham HSHAZ Capital Strand – spend performance by project				
	Outturn expenditure	Forecast as of Y1Q4	% of forecast target (RAG)	% of new target
Project 1 Project Officer Costs	£107,022	£113,250	95	100
Project 2 Conservation Area Appraisal	£14,882	£12,750	117	100
Project 3 Public Realm Masterplan	£50,125	£50,000	100	100
Project 4 Preliminary Works and Architect Fees	£10,840	£0	*	100
Project 5 Conserving the Buildings and Restoring Shopfronts	£92,187	£135,700	76*	100
Project 6 Purchase Costs for Public Realm	£100,038	£62,500	160	100
<b>HE Grant (sub-total)</b>	<b>£375,094</b>	<b>£380,000</b>	<b>99</b>	<b>100</b>
<i>LA Funding</i>	£326,630	£85,749	381	100
<i>Other match funding</i>	£177,546	£111,500	159	100
<b>Total</b>	<b>£879,270</b>	<b>£577,249</b>	<b>152</b>	<b>100</b>

Note: Assessment status is green for <=100%, 100%<amber>=110% and red for >110%

To note that Project 4 and 5 have been redefined. As such, the original target for these projects have been recorded as Project 5 only and the target has been based on the combined performance.

Swaffham HSHAZ delivered on the majority of output targets across the high street, with many additional outputs delivered over the course of the programme that were not originally forecast. The most outputs of note were the 3,000 square metres of improved public realm, including benches, planting, bus shelters, cycle stands and supplementary wayfinding throughout Swaffham high street. The scheme repaired/conserved a total of three historic buildings or heritage assets of significance within the town, but unfortunately only delivered a third of the proposed shopfront restorations. At project closure, a total of 60 list entries had been amended and an additional building was placed on this list. To enhance wayfinding around the town, the investment installed ten interpretation boards/displays around the town as well as a new town guide/trail.

Table 3-3: Swaffham HSHAZ Capital Strand – output performance				
	Achieved outputs	Forecast as of Y2Q2	% of forecast target (RAG)	% of new target
Number of historic building or heritage asset repaired/conserved	3	1	300	100
Number of historic shopfronts restored or reinstated	2	6	33	25
Public realm area improved (sqm)	3000	0		100
Number of amended list entries	60	2	3000	100
Number of new list entries	1	1	100	100
Number of town guides/trails	1	0		100
Number of interpretation boards/displays	10	0		100

New or revised heritage statement or conservation management plan	1	0		100
Supplementary planning or design guidance	1	2	50	100
Number of consultation events/activities (including online)	4	0		100
Number of engagement events/activities (including online)	1	0		100
Number of public events/activities (e.g. open day)	4	0		100

Note: Assessment status is green for <=100%, amber for 65-100%, and red for <65%

### 3.3 Cultural strand

As stated above, the evaluation of the cultural strand performance is made difficult by a lack of information in terms of original targets and expected spend.

The overall spend for the cultural strand was nearly £87,000, with Historic England's contribution comprising £81,000. The Historic England investment exceeded the expected allocation of £50,450, partly due to a number of new projects identified compared to the envisaged list of interventions from the scheme plan in Y3Q3. The new projects account for £38,000 of the overspend, whilst the originally identified projects overspent by around £7,500. These projects were confirmed through a change request, whereby the team highlighted the events that had been organised over the two years including the Mapping Marketplace project.

Table 3-4: Swaffham HSHAZ Cultural Strand – Spend performance			
	Outturn expenditure	Forecast as of Y3Q4	% of forecast target (RAG)
<b>Cultural strand</b>			
Project 1 Community Mosaic	£11,596	£8,600	135
Project 2 Archaeological Excavation	£9,549	£10,000	95
Project 3 Drama	£0	£3,000	0
Project 4 Family Fun Day	£1,115	£9,200	12
Project 5 Other Activities	£441	£2,150	21
Project 6 New Activities not in Original Bid	£3,187	£2,500	127
Project 7 Administration	£16,036	£13,000	123
Project 8 Coronation Challenge	£1,062	£2,000	53
Project 9 Mapping Marketplace	£10,938	£0	-
Project 10 Food Event, Artisan Fair	£3,321	£0	-
Project 11 Horkey	£7,323	£0	-
Project 12 Working With Schools	£337	£0	-
Project 13 Organisation Days	£0	£0	-
Project 14 Closing Event	£3,895	£0	-
Project 15 Legacy	£12,201	£0	-
<b>HE Grant</b>	<b>£81,000</b>	<b>£50,450</b>	<b>161</b>

LA Funding	£500	£0	-
Other match funding	£5,417	£9,000	60
<b>Total</b>	<b>£86,917</b>	<b>£59,450</b>	<b>146</b>

Note: Assessment status is green for <=100%, 100%<amber>=110% and red for >110%

Overall, a large majority of the forecast outputs were successfully delivered by the Swaffham HSHAZ cultural strand. In particular, the number of artist days in residence were above that of what was forecasted (62 compared to 42 days), and the number of engagement activities too (20 compared to 18).

It should be noted that only two-thirds of the number of school education events and activities were delivered. 14 of 15 public events or activities were delivered by the strand, because of the pandemic restrictions limiting the extent to which these could be safely delivered as well as disruption to one event due to the death of the Queen.

Table 3-5: Swaffham HSHAZ Cultural Strand – Output performance			
	Achieved outputs	Forecast as of Y3Q4	% of forecast target (RAG)
<b>Cultural Strand</b>			
Number of artworks / installations	6	6	100
Number of artists in residence days	62	42	148
Number of exhibition open days	3	3	100
Number of interpretation boards/digital displays	20	20	100
Number of town guides/heritage trails	50	50	100
Number of engagement events/activities	20	18	111
Number of heritage/archaeological research studies	2	2	100
Number of public events/activities	14	15	93
Number of school education events/activities	6	9	67

Note: Assessment status is green for <=100%, amber for 65-100%, and red for <65%

## 4 Value for money

A value for money assessment has been undertaken in line with HM Treasury Green Book, Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government (MHCLG) Appraisal Guide, and relevant departmental guidance such as the Department for Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS) Capital and Heritage Framework. As set out within the MHCLG Appraisal Guide, projects should be appraised based on a **Benefit Cost Ratio (BCR)**<sup>3</sup>.

Monetised costs and benefits from over the HSHAZ programme have been converted to 2024/25 prices using the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) deflators. As all benefits and costs have been inserted in Year 0 with appropriate 2024/25 values applied, there is no discounting required in the analysis. Zero optimism bias has been applied as the costs are known and have been expended. Additionally, no optimism bias has been applied to the benefits as the analysis is based on actual outputs. However, the uncertainty in any values is explained.

The following benefits have been monetised, with 71.5% additionality applied based on guidance for regeneration through capital projects and image/culture:

- **Amenity (capital strand):** Consistent with the MHCLG Appraisal Guide, new open spaces in an urban environment have an economic benefit of £128,658 per hectare per annum (2024/25 prices). It has been assumed that 10% of the public realm delivered as part of the programme are new open spaces. In line with recent appraisals, 50% of per hectare value (£64,329) has been applied to remainder of the public realm which relates to improvements of existing spaces.
- **Labour supply (cultural strand):** There was no commercial space brought back into use to generate new employment in the capital strand. The artists into residence in the cultural strand have been converted into Full-Time Equivalent jobs based on the number of days supported. The number of jobs created have been calculated using employment densities and in line with MHCLG guidance, a local GVA per worker figure is applied to the jobs taken up by new entrants. In line with guidance, it is assumed 10% of jobs will be occupied by new entrants and there will be a 40% welfare impact for these jobs with the benefit experienced across five years.
- **Wellbeing benefits from new employment (cultural strand):** New employment opportunities are known to have a positive impact on individuals' wellbeing when moving from unemployment into employment. Values from Green Book's Supplementary Wellbeing Guidance have been applied to the new entrants.
- **Cultural use (capital and cultural strand):** As set out in the Culture and Heritage Capital Evidence Bank, which is cited in the Green Book Wellbeing Guidance, these benefits relate to the willingness to pay of local residents to attend cultural events and assets. This value has been applied to the attendees to engagement and cultural activities, as well as forecasted attendees to artworks/installations.

<sup>3</sup> The BCR can be interpreted as the estimated level of benefit per £1 of cost. It is used as the core element in the measure of Value for Money (VfM) when interventions involve a net cost to the public sector.

- **Heritage use and non-use – historic buildings conserved (capital strand):** Use and non-use benefits from the historic buildings or heritage assets repaired/conserved have been estimated using benefit transfer approaches from the DCMS Cultural and Heritage Capital Evidence Bank. ‘The Economic Value of Heritage: A Benefit Transfer Study’ considered use and non-use values from works to improve the maintenance and conservation of historic buildings in various cities, a similar initiative to the historic building conservation works in the HSHAZ programme. We have applied the use value to the estimated footfall in each HSHAZ from the mobile phone data and the non-use value to residents in the local authority (minus the users).
- **Heritage use and non-use – shopfront improvements (capital strand):** The restoration and improvement of historic high street shopfronts is a key component of the capital element of the HSHAZ programme. This aspect of the programme cannot be accurately valued using a benefits transfer approach in which the use and non-use economic benefit findings of an existing similar study, for example from the DCMS Evidence Bank, would be applied. For this reason, AMION has undertaken a bespoke contingent valuation and benefits transfer study as set out within the next section to assess the use and non-use economic benefits attributed to the restoration and improvement of historic high street shopfronts delivered across England through the HSHAZ programme. We have applied the use value to the estimated footfall in each HSHAZ from the mobile phone data and the non-use value to residents in the local authority (minus the users).
- **Wellbeing benefits from volunteering (capital and cultural strand):** As set out in the Green Book Supplementary Guidance for Wellbeing, volunteering is associated with enhanced wellbeing, with the value estimated using the subjective wellbeing valuation approach cited in this government guidance. The core from the Wellbeing guidance has been applied to the volunteer hours.
- **Wellbeing benefits from education and social programmes (capital and cultural strand):** The Green Book Supplementary Guidance for Wellbeing shows that life satisfaction improves based on participation in education and social development programmes. The core value from the Wellbeing guidance has been applied to attendees at education events and training sessions.
- **Active mode (capital strand)<sup>4</sup>:** The interpretation boards and digital displays will deliver wayfinding benefits for residents and visitors which can be measured using Department for Transport guidance. The benefits arising from these improvements have been measured using the DfT Active Mode Appraisal Toolkit (AMAT) over a 30-year appraisal period. The visitors to the enhanced area have been calculated based on the mobile phone footfall data.
- **Strategy development (capital strand):** There has been substantial resource allocated to the wide range of feasibility, research, heritage and conservation management studies. Our assessment has assumed that future development studies are likely to at least deliver benefits in line with their costs, given that they have been led by local partners in line with need.

<sup>4</sup> The active mode benefits have been monetised for the capital strand based on the delivery of enhanced public realm and permanent installation boards/digital displays. The interpretation displays from the cultural strand are assumed to be temporary and therefore, has formed part of the non-monetised assessment

The monetised benefits from the capital and cultural strand are shown below. The main capital strand benefits arise from the heritage benefits from historic buildings conserved and the shopfront improvements as well as amenity and active mode benefits from the new/enhanced public realm alongside new interpretation boards. The cultural strand benefits arise from attendees to events delivered during the HSHAZ programme and wellbeing benefits from volunteers. Although the cultural strand in Swaffham largely delivered its outputs in terms of number of events, the attendee numbers were lower than other HSHAZ cultural strands, which has led slightly lower benefits than expected for this strand.

Table 4-1: Swaffham HSHAZ – Evaluation Summary Table (£000s)			
	Capital strand	Cultural strand	Total Swaffham HSHAZ
Amenity	£242	-	£242
Labour supply	-	£2	£2
Wellbeing from employment	-	£1	£1
Heritage Use	£486	-	£486
Heritage Non-Use	£345	-	£345
Cultural use	£8	£31	£39
Wellbeing from education	-	£1	£1
Wellbeing from volunteering	£2	£47	£49
Active mode	£281	-	£281
Strategy development	£28	-	£28
<b>Total benefits</b>	<b>£1,392</b>	<b>£81</b>	<b>£1,473</b>

The below table demonstrate the results on the cost-benefit analysis. Swaffham HSHAZ is assessed to have an **overall BCR of 1.38:1**, considered ‘**acceptable**’ value for money ( $1.5:1 < \text{BCR} < 2.0:1$ ). The capital strand has a BCR of 1.43:1 and the cultural strand has a BCR of 3.54:1.

Table 4-2: Swaffham HSHAZ – Evaluation Summary Table			
	Capital strand	Cultural strand	Total Swaffham HSHAZ
A. Present Value Benefits (£m)	£1.39	£0.08	£1.47
B. Present Value Costs (£m)	£0.98	£0.09	£1.06
C. Net Present Social Value (A-B)	£0.41	-£0.01	£0.40
<b>D. BCR (A)/B)</b>	<b>1.43:1</b>	<b>0.92:1</b>	<b>1.38:1</b>
<b>E. VfM category</b>	<b>Acceptable</b>	<b>Poor</b>	<b>Acceptable</b>

We have also considered the following non-monetisable benefits using a seven-point scale from ‘large adverse to large significant’ within the MHCLG Appraisal Guide. These non-monetised benefits include:

- **Legacy impacts** – moderate beneficial (important benefit but will not on its own significantly impact on VFM)



- **Image and community perceptions** – moderate beneficial (important benefit but will not on its own significantly impact on VFM)
- **Cultural sector development** – slight beneficial (Small benefit unlikely to have material impact on VFM)

The Swaffham HSHAZ represents ‘**acceptable**’ **value for money**, particularly once the non-monetised benefit assessment is considered alongside the monetised benefit assessment. It will be crucial for Swaffham to ensure the delivery of legacy impacts through this initial regeneration of the high street, for the scheme to be considered an overall success. This legacy effect has started to take place, with further funding allocated for a Partnership in Conservation Area scheme.

## 5 Insights, lessons learned, and legacy impacts

As set out in the Purpose of the Case Study section, this document is not an evaluation of the Swaffham HSHAZ scheme. Its main purpose is to review achieved outputs, assess likely value for money, and identify successes and challenges arising from a facilitated workshop.

### 5.1 Key successes

The key success for the Swaffham HSHAZ is the additional Historic England funding of £355,000 for a Partnership in Conservation Area scheme that looks to continue the work started by the HSHAZ. This will allow **further capital works to take place with suggested target buildings including Puff and Stuff, Market Cross Café and Hammonds**. The development of the Swaffham Town Masterplan is another success for the scheme and was implemented when considering the capital works to be undertaken at Tutankhamun's and Mr Chips. Another success of the scheme was the delivery of complementary public realm and wayfinding in addition to capital works, supporting the experience of Swaffham town centre.

The cultural activities were well attended.

### 5.2 Challenges

The main challenge of the scheme was the unrealistic nature of the spending profile, especially considering the lack of initial momentum of project delivery due to Covid 19. Overall, the **increase in cost of material and labour alongside the loss of spending due to spend profile inflexibility** meant that loss of money had substantial consequences for the delivery of schemes. These consequences were further amplified due to the relatively small size of the Swaffham scheme.

The programme administration was considered challenging, with insufficient resource to deliver all requirements from Historic England. For example, final reports to contribute to the evaluation and pre-intervention photo requests were made in 2024 (at the scheme's closure) rather than in 2019 (at the scheme's start). Not only was it made harder to source this information, but it was also made difficult reflecting back on four years of delivery. These last-minute requests significantly increased the workload of the team during the scheme's instrumental final delivery stage. The deadlines and complexity of the programme, within a relatively tight budget, resulted in many people placed under stress and pressure.

Relationship building with business owners was challenging. The scheme was starting from scratch which meant that it was some time before any businesses were fully engaged.

### 5.3 Legacy impacts

As a result of the Swaffham HSHAZ, Historic England encouraged **Breckland Council to submit a further bid of £355,000 for a Partnership in Conservation Area (PSiCA) scheme which looks to continue the work started by the HSHAZ**. The bid was successful and the PSiCA programme includes funding for further building grant works throughout the town. Additional public realm works will also be delivered by the PSiCA. The work will support the development of technical proposals looking towards a larger-scale reconfiguration of the Marketplace in the future.

The PSiCA scheme includes a community engagement and training initiative to educate owners and businesses on the repair and maintenance of historic properties, thus equipping local tradespeople with skills to maintain historic properties.

The Swaffham team have an increased awareness and knowledge as to the importance of heritage led regeneration and have learned a substantial amount through the delivery of the HSHAZ programme and from the Historic England support provided.

The Swaffham Town Centre Masterplan and Swaffham Conservation Area Appraisal are new documents funded through the HSHAZ as part of assessing Swaffham's history and heritage. These strategies present ways in which the Market Place can be improved and provide a better experience for local people and tourists, influencing future development of the town centre and enhancing its attractiveness.

Building on the works delivered by the HSHAZ, funding of £250,000 from Breckland District Council, Historic England, The National Lottery Heritage Fund, Swaffham Town Council and Norfolk and Norwich Festivals was secured in April 2024 to launch the 'A Historic Market Town' programme. The programme will continue the community grants scheme and restore up to 12 historic buildings.

## 5.4 Lessons learned

The learning curve over the duration of the Swaffham HSHAZ was steep, with **restrictions on delivery and a general lack of momentum at the initial point of the scheme causing a significant amount of work required for completion**. The spend profile for the programme was very difficult and if Swaffham were to partner with Historic England again with similar spend profile restrictions imposed, the division of funds would be adjusted to account for the development of works.

The cultural consortium and delivery team felt there was little synergy between the two strands. **Enhanced communication should be implemented in future initiatives to create connections between cultural and capital works**, maximising the benefits from both. Despite this, the cultural team achieved a successful programme that saw Swaffham residents engaged and interested in the works delivered. The cultural team also had influence in closing the roads in the town centre, achieving one of the initial objectives for Swaffham of reducing the through traffic. The supportive nature of the cultural strand proved to be influential among the residents of Swaffham and will be considered a valuable delivery mechanism in future projects. The success of the cultural strand proved the importance of community engagement for a regeneration programme, which should be integrated in future projects.

Another lesson learned over the duration of the Swaffham HSHAZ scheme was the **critical role of the HAZ project officer position** in keeping the scheme together and projects on track. This central role was vital for the success of project delivery and provided stability over the programme duration. If a future project of this or a similar nature were delivered, this position would be encouraged.

The historic nature of Swaffham town provided it with a good foundation for delivery of heritage regeneration and unlocked future schemes to continue this progress.